

SCRUTINY CO-ORDINATION COMMITTEE

14 July 2010

Members Present: Councillor Foster
Councillor Lakha
Councillor Lancaster
Councillor Mrs Lucas (Chair)
Councillor McNicholas (Deputy Chair)
Councillor Noonan (Substitute for Councillor Ridley)
Councillor Ruane
Councillor Sawdon
Councillor Walsh (Substitute for Councillor M. Mutton)
Councillor Williams (Substitute for Councillor Taylor)

Other Members Present: Councillor Bigham (For the matter in Minute 3 below)
Councillor Smith (For the matter in Minute 3 below)

Employees Present: P. Beesley (City Services and Development Directorate)
D. Cockcroft (City Services and Development Directorate)
C. Evans (Finance and Legal Services Directorate)
J. Parry (Chief Executive's Directorate)
S. Rudge (Community Services Directorate)
M. Salmon (Customer and Workforce Services Directorate)
C. Steele (Chief Executive's Directorate)
A. West (Chief Executive's Directorate)

Apologies: Councillor M. Mutton
Councillor Ridley
Councillor Taylor

Public Business

1. Declarations of Interest

With reference to minute 3 below, headed "Proposed New Salvation Army Residential Centre, Harnall Lane West", Councillor McNicholas and Councillor Lakha informed the Committee that they had attended the meeting of the Planning Committee on 14th January 2010 at which the planning application for this development had been considered and indicated that they had taken part in the decision on this matter (Planning Committee minute 185/09 refers). In this regard, Legal Services had advised Councillor McNicholas and Councillor Lakha that they were not required to declare an interest at this meeting and the Members asked that this be recorded accordingly.

2. Minutes

The minutes of the meeting held on 14th April 2010, were submitted for information.

3. Consideration of Call-ins – Stage 2 – Proposed New Salvation Army Residential Centre, Harnall Lane West

The Committee received a report of the Director of City Services and Development that had been considered by Cabinet Member (City Development) (their Minute 3/10 refers) and was called in by Councillors Ridley, Foster and Smith.

The report detailed the objections received during the 21 day public notice of closure for the car park at Harnall Lane West. This formal process was required prior to consideration of the closure of the car park which was proposed to enable the Salvation Army Scheme for a new 80 bedroom centre with training and enterprise facilities to be developed on the site.

The Cabinet Member had agreed to:

- a) Consider the objections including the petitions received to the proposed closure of the Harnall Lane West car park and the community consultation referred to in section 6 of the report, in accordance with the relevant regulations contained in the Local Authorities' Traffic Orders (Procedure) (England & Wales) Regulations 1996, together with the officer's responses indicating the alternative car parks in the vicinity. The map and car park data tabled at the meeting to be attached to the minutes.
- b) Subject to consideration of a) above approve the closure of the car park and authorise the Director of Finance and Legal Services to advertise any modifications to the Road Traffic Order, which removes Harnall Lane West car park from the Order.
- c) Officers be tasked to review the provision of car parking spaces for those with disabilities, in the vicinity of Harnall Lane West. Petition spokespersons, those who have submitted written objections and ward Councillors will be notified of the outcome of the review by the end of September, 2010.

The reason for the call-in was:-

"What are the reasons that officers did not explore a further option in section 5 of the report the Salvation Army to the Old Council House Depot on the Foleshill Road."

The call-in had been deemed valid by the Chair of Scrutiny Co-ordination Committee on advice from the Assistant Director (Democratic Services) and in conjunction with the Council Solicitor/Assistant Director (Legal Services), as the Old Council Depot had not been considered previously.

Councillor Foster, a Member of the Scrutiny Co-ordination Committee, and Councillor Smith, who attended the meeting for this matter, spoke in support of the call-in requesting that the former City Engineer's Department Central Depot on the Foleshill Road be considered in some depth as an alternative site for the location of the new Salvation Army Centre.

The Cabinet Member (City Development), who attended the meeting for this matter, confirmed that planning consent for the temporary use of the land in Harnall lane west as a car park was granted to the Primary Car trust in November 2003. The consent required the use to cease no later than March 2008, the reason for this condition being that ' The use of the site on a long term basis as a public car park following the relocation of the Coventry & Warwickshire hospital would be contrary Policy CC45 of the Coventry Development plan 2001, which seeks the long term use of the site for NHS or other mixed use development'.

The Committee considered a briefing note of the Director of City Services and Development that provided background information to the issue and addressed matters raised by the call-in, confirming that the Coventry City Council former Depot Site had been considered and discounted as it did not meet the criteria used to assess the suitability of potential sites.

Councillors questioned the Cabinet Member and officers on the matter and discussed, at some length, issues relating to the call-in and project proposals which included:

- The mixed use development of available sites in the City and the availability of a combination of housing stock, including social housing such as the Salvation Army Centre, on appropriate sites.
- The value of residential land and commercial development of land in the City.
- The provision of sufficient replacement car parking in the area and facilities for disabled parking, following the closure of the Harnall Lane West Car Park.
- The criteria used to assess the suitability of potential sites for the development.
- The legal requirement for access and egress, traffic and highways infrastructure, and the masterplan requirements for the development of the former depot site.
- The implications of developing part of the former depot site and the increase in costs for the Salvation Army for delivering the hostel project on the site due to the infrastructure requirements of servicing part of a larger site.
- The project and funding implications for further delays to the proposals for the new Centre.
- The temporary car park provision agreed in November 2003 by the Council and the PCT as part of their purchase of the Council's nearby Russell Street car park for inclusion in a new city centre health centre project, which due to a delay in commencing the project, resulted in the condition on the temporary consent not being enforced in 2008.
- The purpose of the new Salvation Army Centre, the facilities it would provide to both residents and the local community, and the location it required to operate successfully.

The Chair reported on a letter she had received from Mr H. Dhokia, the Chairman of the Coventry and Warwickshire Hindhu Council, sent on behalf of Shree Krishna Temple, Guru Nanak Prakash Gurudwara, the Catholic Polish Church, the local business community and residents, outlining concerns relating to the closure of the Harnall Lane Car park. The Chair informed the Committee that the letter had been passed to Legal Services who would respond directly to Mr Dhokia on the issues raised.

The Committee considered the call-in and voted on the decision, requesting that the vote be recorded in the minutes, as follows:

1) Concur with the Cabinet Member (City Development) decision.

6 Members for and 4 Members against.

2) Ask the Cabinet Member to reconsider the decision, requesting that officers revisit the siting of the new Salvation Army Centre and investigate further the former City Council Central Depot site, Foleshill Road as an alternative location for the development.

4 Members for and 6 Members against.

RESOLVED that the Scrutiny Co-ordination Committee concur with the decision of the Cabinet Member (City Development), which includes the Cabinet Member request that officers be tasked to review the provision of car parking for the local community, in the vicinity of Harnall Lane West.

4. **Scrutiny Co-ordination Committee - Membership**

RESOLVED that Councillor Noonan, Health & Social Care Scrutiny Board Chair, be appointed as a non-voting Co-opted Member of Scrutiny Co-ordination Committee.

5. **Scrutiny Board Work Programmes**

The Committee considered the setting of the work programmes for the Scrutiny Boards and discussed the need for work programmes to allow for matters that may arise throughout the year, to be picked up. The Committee agreed that the current economic situation was a priority for Scrutiny consideration and that in accordance with Standing Orders the budget report would need to continue to be submitted to Scrutiny.

RESOLVED that the work programmes for the Boards be considered in more detail at the scheduled Scrutiny Workshops.

6. **Report Back on the Work of Outside Bodies – Coventry Schools Admissions Forum 2009/2010**

The Committee considered a report of Councillor Blundell that detailed the work of the Coventry Schools Admissions Forum over the preceding 12 months and included details of attendance by the City Council's representatives.

RESOLVED to recommend that the Council continue to appoint to the Coventry Schools Admission Forum, a statutory requirement set out in regulations under the Education (Determination of Admission Arrangements (Amendment) Regulation 1999 (SI 1999/126) as amended by SI 2002/2896 and SI 2007/497).

7. **Report Back on the Work of Outside Bodies – Belgrade Theatre Trust 2009/2010**

The Committee considered a report of Councillor Blundell that detailed the work of the Belgrade Theatre Trust over the preceding 12 months and included details of attendance by the City Council's representatives.

The Committee noted that following on from the Guidance Note for Elected Members on Appointments to Outside Bodies, issued by Legal Services in February 2010, the Council Solicitor/Assistant Director (Legal Services) would be arranging a training workshop and preparing frequently asked questions notes for Members, to assist them in this matter.

RESOLVED that the Committee recommend that the City Council continue to appoint two Elected Members to the Board of the Belgrade Theatre Trust.

8. Report Back on the Work of Outside Bodies – Coventry Heritage and Arts Trust 2009/2010

The Committee considered a report of Councillor Blundell that detailed the work of the Coventry Heritage and Arts Trust over the preceding 12 months and included details of attendance by the City Council's representatives.

RESOLVED that the Committee recommend that the City Council continue to appoint two Elected Members to the Coventry Heritage and Arts Trust.

9. Report Back on the Work of Outside Bodies – The Coventry Partnership 2009/2010

The Committee considered a report of Councillor Taylor that detailed the work of the Coventry Partnership over the preceding 12 months and included details of attendance by the City Council's representatives.

RESOLVED that the Committee recommend that the City Council continue to appoint to the Coventry Partnership.

10. Report Back on the Work of Outside Bodies – Coventry, Solihull and Warwickshire Sub-Regional Forum 2009/2010

The Committee considered a report of Councillor Taylor that detailed the work of the Coventry, Solihull and Warwickshire Sub-Regional Forum over the preceding 12 months and included details of attendance by the City Council's representatives.

RESOLVED that the Committee recommend that the City Council continue to appoint to the Coventry, Solihull and Warwickshire Sub-Regional Forum.

11. Report Back on the Work of Outside Bodies – Parking and Traffic Regulations Outside of London Adjudication Joint Committee (PATROLAJC) 2009/2010

The Committee considered a report of Councillor Noonan that detailed the work of the Parking and Traffic Regulations Outside of London Adjudication Joint Committee (PATROLAJC) over the preceding 12 months and included details of attendance by the City Council's representatives.

The Committee noted that the reason for the City Council's involvement in this Body was that the Council was able to access the national adjudication service. This enabled the Authority to comply with a legal requirement under Section 80 of the Traffic Management Act 2004 which entitled any person receiving a penalty charge notice for a parking contravention (or bus lane contravention) to appeal to an Adjudicator if the Council had not accepted his/ her formal representation. Without this the Council would not be able to undertake civil parking enforcement. The appointment of the Adjudication service by the PATROLAJC also enabled the Authority to exercise its legal duty in regard to section 81 of the Traffic Management Act 2004.

RESOLVED that the Committee recommend that the City Council continue to appoint to the Parking and Traffic Regulations Outside of London Adjudication Joint Committee (PATROLAJC).

12. **Report Back on the Work of Outside Bodies – University of Warwick: Advisory Board of the Institute of Education 2009/2010**

The Committee considered a report of Councillor Blundell that detailed the work of the University of Warwick: Advisory Board of the Institute of Education over the preceding 12 months and included details of attendance by the City Council's representatives.

RESOLVED that the Committee recommend that the City Council continue to appoint to the University of Warwick: Advisory Board of the Institute of Education.

13. **Report Back on the Work of Outside Bodies – West Midlands Leaders Board 2009/2010**

The Committee considered a report of Councillor Taylor that detailed the work of the West Midlands Leaders Board over the preceding 12 months and included details of attendance by the City Council's representatives.

RESOLVED that the Committee recommend that the City Council continue to appoint to the West Midlands Leaders Board.

14. **Report Back on the Work of Outside Bodies – West Midlands Regional Assembly 2009/2010**

The Committee considered a report of Councillor Taylor that detailed the work of the West Midlands Regional Assembly over the preceding 12 months and included details of attendance by the City Council's representatives.

The Committee noted that under the Local Democracy, Economic Development and Construction Act the West Midlands Regional Assembly ceased to exist on 31 March 2010. The role of developing an Integrated Strategy for Spatial Planning, Transport and Economic Development, passed to Regional Development Agencies and a regional Local Authorities Leaders' Board.

RESOLVED that, following the cessation of the West Midlands Regional Assembly on 31st March 2010, the Committee recommend that the council appoints to the Assembly's replacement body, the West Midlands Leaders' Board.

15. **Outstanding Issues**

There were no outstanding issues.

16. **Scrutiny Co-ordination Committee Work Programme 2010/2011**

The Committee considered and noted the changes to the Work Programme for the Municipal Year 2010/11.

17. **Meeting Evaluation**

The Board evaluated the meeting. Comments given by members, which included that the meeting had been well organised, Members had been well briefed prior to the meeting, and that documentation and presentations were clear, factual and informative, would be used to ensure the efficiency and effectiveness of future meetings.